

Best Evidence Summaries of Topics in Mental Healthcare

BEST *in* **MH** *clinical question-answering service*

Question

In adults with a diagnosis of Borderline Personality Disorder, how effective is Dialectical Behaviour Therapy (DBT) when compared to Mentalisation Based Therapy (MBT) in improved patient outcomes?

Clarification of question using PICO structure

Patients: Adults with a diagnosis of Borderline Personality Disorder

Intervention: Dialectical behaviour therapy (DBT)

Comparator: Mentalisation based therapy (MBT)

Outcome: Any outcome

Clinical and research implications

No directly relevant studies were found to answer this question.

What does the evidence say?

Number of included studies/reviews (number of participants): No directly relevant studies were identified.

Main Findings: n/a

Authors Conclusions: n/a

Reliability of conclusions/Strength of evidence: n/a

What do guidelines say? No directly relevant UK based guidelines were identified.

Date question received: 25 January 2012

Date searches conducted: 30 January 2012

Date answer completed: 1 February 2012

Search Details

Source	Search Strategy	Number of hits	Relevant evidence identified
<i>SRs and Guidelines</i>			
NHS Evidence	borderline AND (DBT or Dialectic*) AND (MBT OR Mentali\$*)	1	0
DARE	#1 MeSH DESCRIPTOR Borderline Personality Disorder EXPLODE ALL TREES #2 (DBT) OR (Dialectic*) IN DARE #3 (MBT) OR (Mentali\$*) IN DARE #4 (psychotherap*) IN DARE #5 (borderline) IN DARE #6 (therap*) IN DARE #7 #2 OR #3 OR #4 OR #6 #8 #5 AND #7 #9 #1 OR #8	16 14 1 556 212 12992 13049 135 143	0
<i>Primary studies</i>			
CENTRAL	#1 MeSH descriptor Borderline Personality Disorder, this term only #2 (mentalization) or (mentalisation) or (MBCT) #3 (dialectical) or (dialectics) or (DBT) 157 #4 (#1 AND #2 AND #3) 0	197 43 157 0	0
MEDLINE	1. MEDLINE; BORDERLINE PERSONALITY DISORDER/; 2. MEDLINE; "borderline personality disorder".ti,ab; 3. MEDLINE; BPD.ti,ab; 4. MEDLINE; 1 OR 2 OR 3; 5. MEDLINE; mentalisation.ti,ab; 6. MEDLINE; mentalization.ti,ab; 7. MEDLINE; (mentalizing OR mentalising).ti,ab; 8. MEDLINE; MBT.ti,ab; 9. MEDLINE; 5 OR 6 OR 7 OR 8; 10. MEDLINE; "dialectical behav* therapy".ti,ab; 11. MEDLINE; DBT.ti,ab; 12. MEDLINE; dialectical.ti,ab; 13. MEDLINE; 10 OR 11 OR 12; 14. MEDLINE; 4 AND 9 AND 13; 15. MEDLINE; "randomized controlled trial".pt; 16. MEDLINE; "controlled clinical trial".pt; 17. MEDLINE; randomi?ed.ab;	4261 2986 4373 7992 20 127 299 1169 1585 248 966 694 1523 10 317996 83347 279330	0

	18. MEDLINE; placebo.ab; 19. MEDLINE; "drug therapy".fs; 20. MEDLINE; randomly.ab; 21. MEDLINE; trial.ab; 22. MEDLINE; groups.ab; 23. MEDLINE; 15 OR 16 OR 17 OR 18 OR 19 OR 20 OR 21 OR 22; 24. MEDLINE; 14 AND 23;	132136 1493432 172109 241467 1130042 2859114 3	
EMBASE	15. EMBASE; BORDERLINE PERSONALITY DISORDER/; 16. EMBASE; "borderline personality disorder".ti,ab; 17. EMBASE; BPD.ti,ab; 18. EMBASE; 15 OR 16 OR 17; 19. EMBASE; mentalisation.ti,ab; 20. EMBASE; mentalization.ti,ab; .,b.b,mb/.bmz./bm. 21. EMBASE; (mentalizing OR mentalising).ti,ab; 22. EMBASE; MBT.ti,ab; 23. EMBASE; 19 OR 20 OR 21 OR 22; 24. EMBASE; "dialectical behav* therapy".ti,ab; 25. EMBASE; DBT.ti,ab; 26. EMBASE; dialectical.ti,ab; 27. EMBASE; 24 OR 25 OR 26; 28. EMBASE; 18 AND 23 AND 27; 29. EMBASE; random*.tw; 30. EMBASE; factorial*.tw; 31. EMBASE; placebo*.tw; 32. EMBASE; (crossover* OR cross-over*).tw; 33. EMBASE; (doubl* adj3 blind*).tw; 34. EMBASE; (singl* adj3 blind*).tw; 35. EMBASE; assign*.tw; 36. EMBASE; allocat*.tw; 37. EMBASE; volunteer*.tw; 38. EMBASE; CROSSOVER PROCEDURE/; 39. EMBASE; DOUBLE-BLIND PROCEDURE/; 40. EMBASE; SINGLE-BLIND PROCEDURE/; 41. EMBASE; RANDOMIZED CONTROLLED TRIAL/; 42. EMBASE; 29 OR 30 OR 31 OR 32 OR 33 OR 34 OR 35 OR 36 OR 37 OR 38 OR 39 OR 40 OR 41; 43. EMBASE; 28 AND 42;	7312 3760 5380 11496 46 204 373 1417 1999 389 1291 890 1947 13 679440 17764 164540 57930 121175 13243 190075 63956 148411 31733 102763 14735 296357 1126953 4	0
PsycINFO	1. PsycINFO; BORDERLINE PERSONALITY DISORDER/; 2. PsycINFO; "borderline personality disorder".ti,ab; 3. PsycINFO; BPD.ti,ab; 4. PsycINFO; 1 OR 2 OR 3; 6. PsycINFO; mentalization.ti,ab; 7. PsycINFO; mentalisation.ti,ab; 8. PsycINFO; MBT.ti,ab; 9. PsycINFO; (mentalising OR mentalizing).ti,ab; 10. PsycINFO; 6 OR 7 OR 8 OR 9; 11. PsycINFO; DIALECTICAL BEHAVIOR THERAPY/; 12. PsycINFO; "dialectical behav* therapy".ti,ab;	3042 5014 2913 6207 544 78 58 515 1064 376 794	0

	13. PsycINFO; dialectical.ti,ab; 14. PsycINFO; DBT.ti,ab; 15. PsycINFO; 11 OR 12 OR 13 OR 14; 16. PsycINFO; 4 AND 10 AND 15; 17. PsycINFO; CLINICAL TRIALS/; 18. PsycINFO; random*.ti,ab; 19. PsycINFO; groups*.ti,ab; 20. PsycINFO; (doubl* adj3 blind*).ti,ab; 21. PsycINFO; (singl* adj3 blind*).ti,ab; 22. PsycINFO; EXPERIMENTAL DESIGN/; 23. PsycINFO; controlled.ti,ab; 24. PsycINFO; (clinical adj3 study).ti,ab; 25. PsycINFO; trial.ti,ab; 26. PsycINFO; "treatment outcome clinical trial".md; 27. PsycINFO; 17 OR 18 OR 19 OR 20 OR 21 OR 22 OR 23 OR 24 OR 25 OR 26; 28. PsycINFO; 16 AND 27;	3330 593 3417 15 5727 105392 317052 15852 1292 8122 65924 6598 55473 20887 485658 4	
Summary	NA	NA	Summary

Disclaimer

BEST in MH answers to clinical questions are for information purposes only. BEST in MH does not make recommendations. Individual health care providers are responsible for assessing the applicability of BEST in MH answers to their clinical practice. BEST in MH is not responsible or liable for, directly or indirectly, any form of damage resulting from the use/misuse of information contained in or implied by these documents. Links to other sites are provided for information purposes only. BEST in MH cannot accept responsibility for the content of linked sites.