

Best Evidence Summaries of Topics in Mental Healthcare

BEST *in* **MH** *clinical question-answering service*

Question

How effective is art psychotherapy in achieving improved outcomes for adults with a diagnosis of borderline personality disorder?

Clarification of question using PICO structure

Patients: Adults of working age with a diagnosis of borderline personality disorder.

Intervention: Art psychotherapy.

Comparator: Any comparison.

Outcome: Any improved outcomes

Clinical and research implications

No directly relevant studies were found to answer this question.

What does the evidence say?

Number of included studies/reviews (number of participants)

No directly relevant studies were identified.

Main Findings

Authors Conclusions

Reliability of conclusions/Strength of evidence

What do guidelines say?

Art therapy has a focus “on the creation of a trusting therapeutic and safe environment within which people can acknowledge and express strong emotions (Payne, 1993). These interventions are underpinned by the belief that creative processes encourage self-expression, promote self-awareness and increase insight, in the context of a reparative therapeutic relationship, thereby enhancing a person’s psychological wellbeing” (*NICE Guidelines CG78 (1) pp 115*). “Arts therapies have been widely used as a part of treatment programmes for people with borderline and other forms of personality disorder in Britain (Bateman & Fonagy, 1999; Haigh, 2007; Crawford *et al.*, 2007). In this context arts therapies are usually delivered in groups; individual therapy is less commonly provided. While numerous case series have described the use of arts therapies for people

with borderline personality disorder (for example, Olsson & Barth, 1983; Eren *et al.*, 2000; Schmidt, 2002; Gottschalk & Boekholt, 2004; Havsteen-Franklin, 2007) very little research has, so far, attempted to quantify the impact of arts therapies for people with this condition. There is very little research on the effectiveness of arts therapies for people with borderline personality disorder and therefore no recommendations could be made." (*NICE Guidelines CG78 (1) pp 116-117*).

Date question received: 16/10/2012

Date searches conducted: 16/10/2012

Date answer completed: 30/10/2012

References

1. National Institute for Health and Clinical Excellence (2009). *Borderline Personality Disorder. The NICE Guideline: Treatment and Management*. CG78. London: National Institute for Health and Clinical Excellence. <http://www.nice.org.uk/nicemedia/live/12125/43045/43045.pdf>

Search Details

Source	Search Strategy	Number of hits	Relevant evidence identified
<i>SRs and Guidelines</i>			
NICE	borderline AND art psychotherapy	27	1
DARE	1 (borderline AND personality) IN DARE 36 2 (borderline ADJ4 personality) IN DARE 38 3 MeSH DESCRIPTOR Borderline Personality Disorder EXPLODE ALL TREES 19 4 (BPD) IN DARE 33 5 (disorder* ADJ4 personalit*) IN DARE 6 MeSH DESCRIPTOR Personality Disorders EXPLODE ALL TREES 55 7 #1 OR #2 OR #3 OR #4 OR #5 OR #6	119	0
<i>Primary studies</i>			
CENTRAL	1.; BORDERLINE PERSONALITY DISORDER/; 2.; "borderline personality disorder". 3.; 1 OR 2; 4. "art therapy" 5. 3 and 4 = 0 results	0	0
PsycINFO	1. PsycINFO; BORDERLINE PERSONALITY DISORDER/; 3294 results. 2. PsycINFO; "borderline personality disorder".ti,ab; 5297 results. 3. PsycINFO; 1 OR 2; 5901 results. 4. PsycINFO; ART THERAPY/; 3108 results. 5. PsycINFO; "art therapy".ti,ab; 2377 results. 6. PsycINFO; "art psychotherapy".ti,ab; 111 results. 7. PsycINFO; 4 OR 5 OR 6; 3488 results. 8. PsycINFO; 3 AND 7; 11 results.	11	0
MEDLINE	9. MEDLINE; BORDERLINE PERSONALITY DISORDER/; 4518 results. 10. MEDLINE; "borderline personality disorder".ti,ab; 3265 results. 11. MEDLINE; 9 OR 10; 5230 results. 12. MEDLINE; ART THERAPY/; 1044 results.	4	0

	13. MEDLINE; "art therapy".ti,ab; 481 results. 14. MEDLINE; "art psychotherapy".ti,ab; 10 results. 15. MEDLINE; 12 OR 13 OR 14; 1264 results. 16. MEDLINE; 11 AND 15; 4 results.		
EMBASE	17. EMBASE; BORDERLINE PERSONALITY DISORDER/; 7845 results. 18. EMBASE; "borderline personality disorder".ti,ab; 4152 results. 19. EMBASE; 17 OR 18; 8305 results. 20. EMBASE; ART THERAPY/; 1927 results. 21. EMBASE; "art therapy".ti,ab; 875 results. 22. EMBASE; "art psychotherapy".ti,ab; 27 results. 23. EMBASE; 20 OR 21 OR 22; 2184 results. 24. EMBASE; 19 AND 23; 12 results.	12	0
CINAHL	25. CINAHL; BORDERLINE PERSONALITY DISORDER/; 1054 results. 29. CINAHL; "art therapy".ti,ab; 690 results. 26. CINAHL; "borderline personality disorder".ti,ab; 859 results. 31. CINAHL; 28 OR 29 OR 30; 1641 results. 28. CINAHL; ART THERAPY/; 1538 results. 30. CINAHL; "art psychotherapy".ti,ab; 12 results. 27. CINAHL; 25 OR 26; 1204 results. 32. CINAHL; 27 AND 31; 5 results.	5	0
Summary	NA	NA	

Disclaimer

BEST in MH answers to clinical questions are for information purposes only. BEST in MH does not make recommendations. Individual health care providers are responsible for assessing the applicability of BEST in MH answers to their clinical practice. BEST in MH is not responsible or liable for, directly or indirectly, any form of damage resulting from the use/misuse of information contained in or implied by these documents. Links to other sites are provided for information purposes only. BEST in MH cannot accept responsibility for the content of linked sites.