

Best Evidence Summaries of Topics in Mental Healthcare

BEST *in* **MH** *clinical question-answering service*

Question

“In adults with mental health conditions in secure settings, how effective is occupational, art, drama or music therapy, compared to any other intervention, in improving patient related outcomes?”

Clarification of question using PICO structure

Patients: In adults with mental health conditions in secure settings

Intervention: Occupational, art, drama or music therapy

Comparator: Any other intervention

Outcome: Improving patient related outcomes

Clinical and research implications

No relevant, high quality evidence was identified.

What does the evidence say?

Number of included studies/reviews (number of participants)

N/A

Main Findings

N/A

Authors Conclusions

N/A

Reliability of conclusions/Strength of evidence

N/A

What do guidelines say?

NICE guidelines for the management of depression (2010, CG90) recommend a “structured group physical activity programme” (pp.213) for individuals with persistent subthreshold depressive symptoms or mild to moderate depression.

These guidelines (CG90) are “relevant to the work, but will not cover the practice, of those in:

- occupational health services
- social services
- forensic services
- the independent sector.”

(pp. 15)

NICE guidelines for psychosis and schizophrenia in adults (2014, CG178) makes the following definition and recommendations regarding arts therapies;

“Arts therapies are complex interventions that combine psychotherapeutic techniques with activities aimed at promoting creative expression. In all arts therapies:

- the creative process is used to facilitate self-expression within a specific therapeutic framework
- the aesthetic form is used to ‘contain’ and give meaning to the service user’s experience
- the artistic medium is used as a bridge to verbal dialogue and insight-based psychological development if appropriate
- the aim is to enable the patient to experience him/herself differently and develop new ways of relating to others.

Arts therapies currently provided in the UK comprise: art therapy or art psychotherapy, dance movement therapy, body psychotherapy, drama therapy and music therapy.” (pp.217)

“Consider offering arts therapies to all people with psychosis or schizophrenia, particularly for the alleviation of negative symptoms. This can be started either during the acute phase or later, including in inpatient settings.” (pp. 220)

“Arts therapies should be provided by a Health and Care Professions Council registered arts therapist with previous experience of working with people with psychosis or schizophrenia. The intervention should be provided in groups unless difficulties with acceptability and access and engagement indicate otherwise. Arts therapies should combine psychotherapeutic techniques with activity aimed at promoting creative expression, which is often unstructured and led by the service user. Aims of arts therapies should include:

enabling people with psychosis or schizophrenia to experience themselves differently and to develop new ways of relating to others

- helping people to express themselves and to organise their experience into a satisfying aesthetic form
- helping people to accept and understand feelings that may have emerged during the creative process (including, in some cases, how they came to have these feelings) at a pace suited to the person.”

“When psychological treatments, including arts therapies, are started in the acute phase (including in inpatient settings), the full course should be continued after discharge without unnecessary interruption Consider offering arts therapies to assist in promoting recovery, particularly in people with negative symptoms.” (pp.221)

The same guideline provides the following definition and recommendations regarding social skills training;

“• a structured psychosocial intervention (group or individual) that aims to:

- enhance social performance, and
- reduce distress and difficulty in social situations.

The intervention must:

- include behaviourally-based assessments of a range of social and interpersonal skills, and
- place importance on both verbal and non-verbal communication, the individual’s ability to perceive and process relevant social cues, and respond to and provide appropriate social reinforcement.” (pp.286)

“Do not routinely offer social skills training (as a specific intervention) to people with psychosis or schizophrenia.” (pp.288)

However, SIGN guidelines for the management of schizophrenia (2013 CG131) state the following:

“There is insufficient high quality evidence on which to base any recommendation for arts therapies in general.

Group based art therapy should not be routinely offered to individuals diagnosed with schizophrenia.” (pp. 25)

It terms of the applicability of these recommendations to secure services, the SIGN guideline states that the recommendations are evidence based for the care and treatment of adults with schizophrenia but does not make specific recommendations for particular care settings such as forensic units.

Date question received: 13/01/2014
Date searches conducted: 12/11/2013
Date answer completed: 04/03/2014

REFERENCES

Guidelines

National Institute for Health and Care Excellence (2014) Psychosis and schizophrenia in adults. Treatment and management. CG178. London: National Institute for Health and Care Excellence.
<http://www.nice.org.uk/nicemedia/live/14382/66534/66534.pdf>

National Institute for Health and Care Excellence (2010) Depression. The treatment and management of depression in adults (updated edition). CG90. London: National Institute for Health and Care Excellence.
<http://www.nice.org.uk/nicemedia/live/12329/45896/45896.pdf>

Scottish Intercollegiate Guidelines Network (2013) Management of Schizophrenia. CG131. Edinburgh: Scottish Intercollegiate Guidelines Network.
<http://www.sign.ac.uk/pdf/sign131.pdf>

Search Details

Source	Search Strategy	Number of hits	Relevant evidence identified
<i>SRs and Guidelines</i>			
NICE	(art OR drama OR dance) therapy Occupational therapy	387	3
DARE	(forensic* OR secure* OR prison*) IN DARE 111 Delete 2 (offence* OR offense* OR offend*) IN DARE 69 Delete 3 (deviant* OR delinquen*) IN DARE 30 Delete 4 (crime* or criminal*) IN DARE 97 Delete 5 MeSH DESCRIPTOR Forensic Psychiatry EXPLODE ALL TREES 22 Delete 6 MeSH DESCRIPTOR Forensic Nursing EXPLODE ALL TREES 0 Delete 7 MeSH DESCRIPTOR Criminals EXPLODE ALL TREES 6 Delete 8 MeSH DESCRIPTOR Criminal Psychology EXPLODE ALL TREES 3 Delete 9 #1 OR #2 OR #3 OR #4 OR #5 OR #6 OR #7 OR #8	249	0
<i>Primary studies</i>			
CENTRAL	1 MeSH descriptor: [Forensic Psychiatry] explode all trees #2 MeSH descriptor: [Criminals] explode all trees #3 "secure services" #4 "secure care" #5 "secure psychiatric" #6 "secure treatment" #7 "secure settings" #8 "secure hospital" #9 "low secure" or "low security" #10 "medium secure" or "medium security" #11 "high secure" or "high security" #12 "forensic mental health"	661	0

	<p>#13 "forensic psychiatric patient"</p> <p>#14 "forensic service"</p> <p>#15 "forensic hospital"</p> <p>#16 "forensic setting"</p> <p>#17 "forensic unit"</p> <p>#18 "forensic inpatient"</p> <p>#19 "mentally disordered offender"</p> <p>#20 "mentally ill prisoner"</p> <p>#21 "mentally ill offender"</p> <p>#22 correctional</p> <p>#23 "correctional institution"</p> <p>#24 "mental institution"</p> <p>#25 "psychiatric institution"</p> <p>#26 "forensic institution"</p> <p>#27 offender</p> <p>#28 #1 or #2 or #3 or #4 or #5 or #6</p> <p>#29 #7 or #8 or #9 or #10 or #11 or #12</p> <p>#30 #14 or #15 or #16 or #17 or #19 or #22</p> <p>#31 #23 or #24 or #25 or #27</p> <p>#32 #28 or #29 or #30 or #31 = 856</p> <p>Central only 661</p>		
PsycINFO	<p>1. PsycINFO; "secure service*".ti,ab; 123 results.</p> <p>2. PsycINFO; (secure adj3 service*).ti,ab; 272 results.</p> <p>3. PsycINFO; "secure care".ti,ab; 119 results.</p> <p>4. PsycINFO; "secure psychiatric".ti,ab; 187 results.</p> <p>5. PsycINFO; "secure treatment".ti,ab; 27 results.</p> <p>6. PsycINFO; "secure setting*".ti,ab; 189 results.</p>	2377	0

	<p>7. PsycINFO; (secure adj3 hospital*).ti,ab; 267 results.</p> <p>8. PsycINFO; ("low secur*" OR "medium secur*" OR "high secur*").ti,ab; 1120 results.</p> <p>9. PsycINFO; (forensic adj3 psychiat*).ti,ab; 3367 results.</p> <p>10. PsycINFO; (forensic adj3 mental*).ti,ab; 934 results. 11. PsycINFO; (forensic adj3 service*).ti,ab; 660 results. 12. PsycINFO; "forensic mental health*".ti,ab; 737 results.</p> <p>13. PsycINFO; "forensic psychiatric patient*".ti,ab; 202 results.</p> <p>14. PsycINFO; "forensic hospital*".ti,ab; 259 results.</p> <p>15. PsycINFO; "forensic setting*".ti,ab; 758 results.</p> <p>16. PsycINFO; "forensic unit*".ti,ab; 125 results.</p> <p>17. PsycINFO; "mentally disordered offender*".ti,ab; 546 results.</p> <p>18. PsycINFO; "mentally ill prisoner*".ti,ab; 61 results.</p> <p>19. PsycINFO; "mentally ill offender*".ti,ab; 333 results.</p> <p>20. PsycINFO; (correction* adj3 mental).ti,ab; 305 results.</p> <p>21. PsycINFO; (correction* adj3 psychiatric).ti,ab; 88 results.</p> <p>22. PsycINFO; (institution adj3 mental).ti,ab; 257 results.</p> <p>23. PsycINFO; (institution adj3 psychiatric).ti,ab; 356 results.</p> <p>24. PsycINFO; (institution adj3 forensic).ti,ab; 26 results.</p>		
--	---	--	--

<p>25. PsycINFO; offender.ti,ab; 8299 results.</p> <p>26. PsycINFO; FORENSIC PSYCHIATRY/ OR FORENSIC PSYCHOLOGY/; 6475 results.</p> <p>27. PsycINFO; MENTALLY ILL OFFENDERS/; 3069 results.</p> <p>28. PsycINFO; 1 OR 2 OR 3 OR 4 OR 5 OR 6 OR 7 OR 8 OR 9 OR 10 OR 11 OR 12 OR 13 OR 14 OR 15 OR 16 OR 17 OR 18 OR 19 OR 20 OR 21 OR 22 OR 23 OR 24 OR 25 OR 26 OR 27; 20441 results.</p> <p>29. PsycINFO; CLINICAL TRIALS/; 7255 results.</p> <p>30. PsycINFO; random*.ti,ab; 125549 results.</p> <p>31. PsycINFO; groups.ti,ab; 358349 results.</p> <p>32. PsycINFO; (double adj3 blind).ti,ab; 17527 results.</p> <p>33. PsycINFO; (single adj3 blind).ti,ab; 1361 results.</p> <p>34. PsycINFO; EXPERIMENTAL DESIGN/; 8913 results.</p> <p>35. PsycINFO; controlled.ti,ab; 78226 results.</p> <p>36. PsycINFO; (clinical adj3 study).ti,ab; 7702 results.</p> <p>37. PsycINFO; trial.ti,ab; 66156 results.</p> <p>38. PsycINFO; "treatment outcome clinical trial".md; 25761 results.</p> <p>39. PsycINFO; 29 OR 30 OR 31 OR 32 OR 33 OR 34 OR 35 OR 36 OR 37 OR 38; 553772 results.</p> <p>40. PsycINFO; 28 AND 39; 3441 results.</p>		
---	--	--

	<p>41. PsycINFO; 40 [Limit to: (Publication Types 0100 Journal or 0110 Peer-Reviewed Journal or 0120 Non-Peer-Reviewed Journal) and (Document Types Journal Article or Reviews)]; 2377 results.</p> <p>42. PsycINFO; 41 [Limit to: (Publication Types 0100 Journal or 0110 Peer-Reviewed Journal or 0120 Non-Peer-Reviewed Journal) and (Document Types Journal Article or Reviews) and Publication Year 1860-1980]; 170 results.</p> <p>43. PsycINFO; 41 [Limit to: (Publication Types 0100 Journal or 0110 Peer-Reviewed Journal or 0120 Non-Peer-Reviewed Journal) and (Document Types Journal Article or Reviews) and Publication Year 1981-1990]; 306 results.</p> <p>44. PsycINFO; 41 [Limit to: (Publication Types 0100 Journal or 0110 Peer-Reviewed Journal or 0120 Non-Peer-Reviewed Journal) and (Document Types Journal Article or Reviews) and Publication Year 1991-2000]; 468 results.</p> <p>45. PsycINFO; 41 [Limit to: (Publication Types 0100 Journal or 0110 Peer-Reviewed Journal or 0120 Non-Peer-Reviewed Journal) and (Document Types Journal Article or Reviews) and Publication Year 2001-2005]; 475 results.</p> <p>46. PsycINFO; 41 [Limit to: (Publication Types 0100 Journal or 0110 Peer-Reviewed Journal or 0120 Non-Peer-Reviewed Journal) and (Document Types Journal Article or Reviews) and Publication Year 2006-2014]; 959 results.</p>		
Embase	<p>1. EMBASE; (secure adj3 service*).ti,ab; 273 results.</p> <p>2. EMBASE; "secure care".ti,ab; 82 results.</p> <p>3. EMBASE; "secure treatment".ti,ab; 43 results.</p> <p>4. EMBASE; "secure psychiatric".ti,ab; 155 results.</p> <p>5. EMBASE; (secure adj3 psychiat*).ti,ab; 218 results.</p> <p>6. EMBASE; (secure adj3 setting).ti,ab; 95 results.</p> <p>7. EMBASE; (secure adj3 hospital).ti,ab; 198 results.</p>	1063	0

<p>9. EMBASE; "low secur*".ti,ab; 85 results.</p> <p>10. EMBASE; "medium secur*".ti,ab; 401 results.</p> <p>11. EMBASE; "high secur*".ti,ab; 623 results.</p> <p>12. EMBASE; (forensic adj3 mental*).ti,ab; 506 results.</p> <p>13. EMBASE; (forensic adj3 psychiatr*).ti,ab; 3588 results.</p> <p>14. EMBASE; (forensic adj3 service*).ti,ab; 818 results.</p> <p>15. EMBASE; (forensic adj3 hospital*).ti,ab; 555 results.</p> <p>17. EMBASE; (forensic adj3 unit*).ti,ab; 290 results.</p> <p>18. EMBASE; (forensic adj3 setting*).ti,ab; 640 results.</p> <p>19. EMBASE; (forensic adj3 inpatient).ti,ab; 109 results.</p> <p>20. EMBASE; (mental* adj3 prisoner*).ti,ab; 245 results.</p> <p>21. EMBASE; (correction* adj3 mental*).ti,ab; 137 results.</p> <p>22. EMBASE; (correction* adj3 psychiatr*).ti,ab; 95 results.</p> <p>23. EMBASE; (institution adj3 mental*).ti,ab; 398 results.</p> <p>25. EMBASE; (institution adj3 psychiatr*).ti,ab; 378 results.</p> <p>26. EMBASE; (institution adj3 forensic).ti,ab; 28 results.</p> <p>27. EMBASE; offender*.ti,ab; 10094 results.</p> <p>28. EMBASE; FORENSIC PSYCHIATRY/; 12171 results.</p> <p>29. EMBASE; 1 OR 2 OR 3 OR 4 OR 5 OR 6 OR 7 OR 9 OR 10 OR 11 OR 12 OR 13 OR 14 OR 15 OR 17 OR 18 OR 19 OR 20 OR 21 OR 22 OR 23 OR 25 OR 26 OR 27 OR 28; 24880 results.</p> <p>30. EMBASE; random*.tw; 877206 results.</p> <p>31. EMBASE; factorial*.tw; 22828 results.</p> <p>32. EMBASE; placebo*.tw; 200654 results.</p> <p>33. EMBASE; (crossover* OR cross-over*).tw; 69594 results.</p> <p>34. EMBASE; (doubl* adj3 blind*).tw; 143828 results.</p> <p>35. EMBASE; (singl* adj3 blind*).tw; 16662 results.</p> <p>36. EMBASE; assign*.tw; 238638 results.</p> <p>37. EMBASE; allocat*.tw; 82500 results.</p> <p>38. EMBASE; volunteer*.tw; 177304 results.</p>		
---	--	--

	<p>39. EMBASE; CROSSOVER PROCEDURE/; 39628 results.</p> <p>40. EMBASE; DOUBLE-BLIND PROCEDURE/; 119883 results.</p> <p>41. EMBASE; SINGLE-BLIND PROCEDURE/; 18864 results.</p> <p>42. EMBASE; RANDOMIZED CONTROLLED TRIAL/; 365165 results.</p> <p>43. EMBASE; 30 OR 31 OR 32 OR 33 OR 34 OR 35 OR 36 OR 37 OR 38 OR 39 OR 40 OR 41 OR 42; 1413764 results.</p> <p>44. EMBASE; 29 AND 43; 1063 results.</p>		
Medline	<p>30. MEDLINE; (secure adj3 service*).ti,ab; 175 results.</p> <p>31. MEDLINE; "secure care".ti,ab; 46 results.</p> <p>32. MEDLINE; "secure treatment".ti,ab; 31 results.</p> <p>33. MEDLINE; "secure psychiatric".ti,ab; 83 results.</p> <p>34. MEDLINE; (secure adj3 psychiat*).ti,ab; 127 results.</p> <p>35. MEDLINE; (secure adj3 setting).ti,ab; 58 results.</p> <p>36. MEDLINE; (secure adj3 hospital).ti,ab; 118 results.</p> <p>37. MEDLINE; "low secur*".ti,ab; 51 results.</p> <p>38. MEDLINE; "medium secur*".ti,ab; 211 results.</p> <p>39. MEDLINE; "high secur*".ti,ab; 350 results.</p> <p>40. MEDLINE; (forensic adj3 mental*).ti,ab; 314 results.</p> <p>41. MEDLINE; (forensic adj3 psychiat*).ti,ab; 2442 results.</p> <p>42. MEDLINE; (forensic adj3 service*).ti,ab; 539 results.</p> <p>43. MEDLINE; (forensic adj3 hospital*).ti,ab; 364 results.</p> <p>44. MEDLINE; (forensic adj3 unit*).ti,ab; 190 results.</p> <p>45. MEDLINE; (forensic adj3 setting*).ti,ab; 417 results.</p> <p>46. MEDLINE; (forensic adj3 inpatient).ti,ab; 68 results.</p> <p>47. MEDLINE; (mental* adj3 prisoner*).ti,ab; 188 results.</p> <p>48. MEDLINE; (correction* adj3 mental*).ti,ab; 110 results.</p> <p>49. MEDLINE; (correction* adj3 psychiat*).ti,ab; 75 results.</p> <p>50. MEDLINE; (institution adj3 mental*).ti,ab; 383 results.</p> <p>51. MEDLINE; (institution adj3 psychiat*).ti,ab; 290 results.</p> <p>52. MEDLINE; (institution adj3 forensic).ti,ab; 20 results.</p> <p>53. MEDLINE; offender*.ti,ab; 7308 results.</p>	2153	0

	54. MEDLINE; FORENSIC PSYCHIATRY/; 7832 results. 55. MEDLINE; 30 OR 31 OR 32 OR 33 OR 34 OR 35 OR 36 OR 37 OR 38 OR 39 OR 40 OR 41 OR 42 OR 43 OR 44 OR 45 OR 46 OR 47 OR 48 OR 49 OR 50 OR 51 OR 52 OR 53 OR 54; 17259 results. 56. MEDLINE; "randomized controlled trial".pt; 359830 results. 57. MEDLINE; "controlled clinical trial".pt; 86999 results. 58. MEDLINE; randomi?ed.ab; 334941 results. 59. MEDLINE; randomly.ab; 204307 results. 60. MEDLINE; trial.ab; 289275 results. 61. MEDLINE; groups.ab; 1307773 results. 62. MEDLINE; 56 OR 57 OR 58 OR 59 OR 60 OR 61. 1891339 results. 62. MEDLINE; 55 AND 62; 2153 results.		
Summary	NA	NA	

Disclaimer

BEST in MH answers to clinical questions are for information purposes only. BEST in MH does not make recommendations. Individual health care providers are responsible for assessing the applicability of BEST in MH answers to their clinical practice. BEST in MH is not responsible or liable for, directly or indirectly, any form of damage resulting from the use/misuse of information contained in or implied by these documents. Links to other sites are provided for information purposes only. BEST in MH cannot accept responsibility for the content of linked sites.