

# Best Evidence Summaries of Topics in Mental Healthcare

**BEST** *in* **MH** *clinical question-answering service*

## Question

“In adults with social phobia or treatment resistant depression, how effective is group analytic psychotherapy, compared to any other psychological intervention, in improving patient outcomes?”

## Clarification of question using PICO structure

*Patients:* Adults with social phobia or treatment resistant depression

*Intervention:* Group analytic psychotherapy

*Comparator:* Any other psychological intervention

*Outcome:* Improving patient outcomes

## **Clinical and research implications**

No high quality, relevant evidence was identified.

## **What does the evidence say?**

*Number of included studies/reviews (number of participants)*

N/A

*Main Findings*

N/A

*Authors Conclusions*

N/A

*Reliability of conclusions/Strength of evidence*

N/A

## **What do guidelines say?**

Neither NICE nor SIGN guidelines do not comment on the use of group analytic psychotherapy for social phobia.

SIGN guidelines for depression in adults (2010, CG 114) make the following recommendations, although it does not specify group therapy or the type of depression:

“Short term psychodynamic psychotherapy may be considered as a treatment option for patients with depression.” (pp.8)

NICE guidelines for depression in adults (2010, CG90) make the following recommendations, again, no comment about group therapy is made:

“For people with depression who decline an antidepressant, CBT, IPT, behavioural activation and behavioural couples therapy, consider:

- counselling for people with persistent subthreshold depressive symptoms or mild to moderate depression
- short-term psychodynamic psychotherapy for people with mild to moderate depression.

Discuss with the person the uncertainty of the effectiveness of counselling and psychodynamic psychotherapy in treating depression.” (pp.297-298)

**Date question received:** 28/02/2014

**Date searches conducted:** 17/03/2014

**Date answer completed:** 02/04/2014

## References

Scottish Intercollegiate Guidelines Network (2010) Non-pharmaceutical management of depression in adults. A national clinical guideline. Edinburgh: Scottish Intercollegiate Guidelines Network.

<http://www.sign.ac.uk/pdf/sign114.pdf>

National Institute for Health and Clinical Excellence (2010) Depression. The Treatment and Management of Depression in Adults. (Updated Edition). CG90. London: National Institute for Health and Care Excellence.

<http://www.nice.org.uk/nicemedia/live/12329/45896/45896.pdf>

## Search Details

### Treatment Resistant Depression

Source	Search Strategy	Number of hits	Relevant evidence identified
<b><i>SRs and Guidelines</i></b>			
NICE	depression AND analytic	133	1
DARE	1 MeSH DESCRIPTOR Psychoanalytic Therapy EXPLODE ALL TREES 20 Delete 2 MeSH DESCRIPTOR Psychotherapy, Group EXPLODE ALL TREES 192 Delete 3 (Group adj1 therap* OR psychoanal* OR anal* adj1 psychotherap*) IN DARE 190 Delete 4 ((augmentation OR resistant OR resistance) AND depression) IN DARE 87 Delete 5 ((depression AND treatment-resistance)) IN DARE 12 Delete 6 MeSH DESCRIPTOR Depressive Disorder, Treatment-Resistant EXPLODE ALL TREES 6 Delete 7 MeSH DESCRIPTOR Depression EXPLODE ALL TREES 496 Delete 8 MeSH DESCRIPTOR Depressive Disorder EXPLODE ALL TREES 892 Delete 9 MeSH DESCRIPTOR Depressive Disorder, Major EXPLODE ALL TREES 278 Delete 10 #4 OR #5 OR #6 OR #7 OR #8 OR #9 1335 Delete 11 #1 OR #2 OR #3 350 Delete 12 #10 AND #11 69 Delete	69	0
<b><i>Primary studies</i></b>			
CENTRAL	#1 group analytic psychotherapy 160 #2 "group analysis" 1538 #3 MeSH descriptor: [Psychotherapy, Group] explode all trees 2249 #4 MeSH descriptor: [Psychoanalytic Therapy] explode all trees 150 #5 #1 or #2 or #3 or #4 4027 #6 MeSH descriptor: [Depressive Disorder, Treatment-Resistant] explode all trees 22 #7 "treatment resistant depression" 235	1	

	<p>#8 "treatment refractory depression" 18</p> <p>#9 #6 or #7 or #8 261</p> <p>#10 #5 and #9 19</p> <p>Central only 1</p>		
PsycINFO	<p>1. PsycINFO; "group analytic psychotherapy".ti,ab; 133 results.</p> <p>2. PsycINFO; ANALYTICAL PSYCHOTHERAPY/; 1396 results.</p> <p>3. PsycINFO; GROUP THERAPY/; 16764 results.</p> <p>4. PsycINFO; 2 AND 3; 183 results.</p> <p>5. PsycINFO; (group adj3 "analytic psychotherapy").ti,ab; 142 results.</p> <p>6. PsycINFO; "group analysis".ti,ab; 1957 results.</p> <p>7. PsycINFO; GROUP PSYCHOTHERAPY/; 16764 results.</p> <p>8. PsycINFO; 1 OR 2 OR 3 OR 4 OR 5 OR 6 OR 7; 19244 results.</p> <p>9. PsycINFO; TREATMENT RESISTANT DEPRESSION/ OR TREATMENT RESISTANT DISORDERS/; 3410 results.</p> <p>10. PsycINFO; "treatment resistant depression".ti,ab; 968 results.</p> <p>11. PsycINFO; "treatment refractory depression".ti,ab; 75 results.</p> <p>12. PsycINFO; 9 OR 10 OR 11; 3746 results.</p> <p>13. PsycINFO; 8 AND 12; 13 results.</p>	13	
Embase	<p>27. EMBASE; "group analytic psychotherapy".ti,ab; 51 results.</p> <p>28. EMBASE; ANALYTICAL PSYCHOTHERAPY/; 0 results.</p> <p>29. EMBASE; GROUP THERAPY/; 15694 results.</p> <p>30. EMBASE; 28 AND 29; 0 results.</p> <p>31. EMBASE; (group adj3 "analytic psychotherapy").ti,ab; 54 results.</p> <p>32. EMBASE; "group analysis".ti,ab; 3880 results.</p> <p>33. EMBASE; GROUP PSYCHOTHERAPY/; 15694 results.</p> <p>34. EMBASE; 27 OR 28 OR 29 OR 30 OR 31 OR 32 OR 33; 19338 results.</p> <p>35. EMBASE; TREATMENT RESISTANT DEPRESSION/ OR TREATMENT RESISTANT DISORDERS/; 546 results.</p> <p>36. EMBASE; "treatment resistant depression".ti,ab; 1451 results.</p>	10 (less duplicates =8)	

	37. EMBASE; "treatment refractory depression".ti,ab; 118 results. 38. EMBASE; 35 OR 36 OR 37; 1736 results. 39. EMBASE; 34 AND 38; 10 results.		
Medline	14. MEDLINE; "group analytic psychotherapy".ti,ab; 9 results. 15. MEDLINE; ANALYTICAL PSYCHOTHERAPY/; 0 results. 16. MEDLINE; GROUP THERAPY/; 11640 results. 17. MEDLINE; 15 AND 16; 0 results. 18. MEDLINE; (group adj3 "analytic psychotherapy").ti,ab; 10 results. 19. MEDLINE; "group analysis".ti,ab; 2792 results. 20. MEDLINE; GROUP PSYCHOTHERAPY/; 11640 results. 21. MEDLINE; 14 OR 15 OR 16 OR 17 OR 18 OR 19 OR 20; 14382 results. 22. MEDLINE; TREATMENT RESISTANT DEPRESSION/ OR TREATMENT RESISTANT DISORDERS/; 186 results. 23. MEDLINE; "treatment resistant depression".ti,ab; 1006 results. 24. MEDLINE; "treatment refractory depression".ti,ab; 80 results. 25. MEDLINE; 22 OR 23 OR 24; 1170 results. 26. MEDLINE; 21 AND 25; 5 results.	5	
	Total results (less duplicates)	26	
<b>Summary</b>	<b>NA</b>	<b>NA</b>	

### Social Phobia

Source	Search Strategy	Number of hits	Relevant evidence identified
<b><i>SRs and Guidelines</i></b>			
NICE	social phobia AND analytic	24	0
DARE	1 MeSH DESCRIPTOR Psychoanalytic Therapy EXPLODE ALL TREES 20 Delete 2 MeSH DESCRIPTOR Psychotherapy, Group EXPLODE ALL TREES 192 Delete	87	0

	<p>3 (social adj1 phobia OR anxiety) IN DARE 1159 Delete</p> <p>4 (Group adj1 therap* OR psychoanal* OR anal* adj1 psychotherap*) IN DARE 190 Delete</p> <p>5 #1 OR #2 OR #4 350 Delete</p> <p>6 MeSH DESCRIPTOR Phobic Disorders EXPLODE ALL TREES 39 Delete</p> <p>7 #3 OR #6 1172 Delete</p> <p>8 #5 AND #7 87 Delete</p> <p>9 #5 AND #8 406 Delete</p>		
<b>Primary studies</b>			
CENTRAL	<p>#1 group analytic psychotherapy 160</p> <p>#2 "group analysis" 1538</p> <p>#3 MeSH descriptor: [Psychotherapy, Group] explode all trees 2249</p> <p>#4 MeSH descriptor: [Psychoanalytic Therapy] explode all trees 150</p> <p>#5 #1 or #2 or #3 or #4 4027</p> <p>#6 "social phobia" 683</p> <p>#7 "social anxiety disorder" 309</p> <p>#8 "social anxiety" 568</p> <p>#9 #6 or #7 or #8 1039</p> <p>#10 #5 and #9 93</p> <p>Central only</p>	58	
PsycINFO	<p>1. PsycINFO; "group analytic psychotherapy".ti,ab; 133 results.</p> <p>2. PsycINFO; ANALYTICAL PSYCHOTHERAPY/; 1396 results.</p> <p>3. PsycINFO; GROUP THERAPY/; 16764 results.</p> <p>4. PsycINFO; 2 AND 3; 183 results.</p> <p>5. PsycINFO; (group adj3 "analytic psychotherapy").ti,ab; 142 results.</p> <p>6. PsycINFO; "group analysis".ti,ab; 1957 results.</p> <p>7. PsycINFO; GROUP PSYCHOTHERAPY/; 16764 results.</p> <p>8. PsycINFO; 1 OR 2 OR 3 OR 4 OR 5 OR 6 OR 7; 19244 results.</p> <p>9. PsycINFO; SOCIAL PHOBIA/; 3336 results.</p> <p>10. PsycINFO; SOCIAL ANXIETY/ OR SOCIAL ANXIETY DISORDER/; 5866 results.</p>	114	

	<p>11. PsycINFO; "social anxiety*".ti,ab; 5270 results.</p> <p>12. PsycINFO; 9 OR 10 OR 11; 7682 results.</p> <p>13. PsycINFO; 8 AND 12; 208 results.</p> <p>14. PsycINFO; CLINICAL TRIALS/; 7361 results.</p> <p>15. PsycINFO; random*.ti,ab; 127202 results.</p> <p>16. PsycINFO; groups.ti,ab; 361525 results.</p> <p>17. PsycINFO; (double adj3 blind).ti,ab; 17682 results.</p> <p>18. PsycINFO; (single adj3 blind).ti,ab; 1381 results.</p> <p>19. PsycINFO; EXPERIMENTAL DESIGN/; 8971 results.</p> <p>20. PsycINFO; controlled.ti,ab; 79198 results.</p> <p>21. PsycINFO; (clinical adj3 study).ti,ab; 7782 results.</p> <p>22. PsycINFO; trial.ti,ab; 67013 results.</p> <p>23. PsycINFO; "treatment outcome clinical trial".md; 26252 results.</p> <p>24. PsycINFO; 14 OR 15 OR 16 OR 17 OR 18 OR 19 OR 20 OR 21 OR 22 OR 23; 559094 results.</p> <p>25. PsycINFO; 13 AND 24; 114 results.</p>		
Embase	<p>15. EMBASE; ANALYTICAL PSYCHOTHERAPY/; 0 results.</p> <p>16. EMBASE; GROUP THERAPY/; 15694 results.</p> <p>17. EMBASE; 15 AND 16; 0 results.</p> <p>18. EMBASE; (group adj3 "analytic psychotherapy").ti,ab; 54 results.</p> <p>19. EMBASE; "group analysis".ti,ab; 3880 results.</p> <p>20. EMBASE; GROUP PSYCHOTHERAPY/; 15694 results.</p> <p>21. EMBASE; 14 OR 15 OR 16 OR 17 OR 18 OR 19 OR 20; 19338 results.</p> <p>22. EMBASE; SOCIAL PHOBIA/; 7038 results.</p> <p>23. EMBASE; SOCIAL ANXIETY/ OR SOCIAL ANXIETY DISORDER/; 7076 results.</p> <p>24. EMBASE; "social anxiety*".ti,ab; 3916 results.</p> <p>25. EMBASE; 22 OR 23 OR 24; 8576 results.</p> <p>26. EMBASE; 21 AND 25; 183 results.</p> <p>27. EMBASE; random*.ti,ab; 850207 results.</p>	62 (less duplicates =49)	



	<p>28. EMBASE; factorial*.ti,ab; 22209 results.</p> <p>29. EMBASE; (crossover* OR cross-over*).ti,ab; 66921 results.</p> <p>30. EMBASE; placebo*.ti,ab; 192449 results.</p> <p>31. EMBASE; (doubl* ADJ blind*).ti,ab; 137472 results.</p> <p>32. EMBASE; (singl* ADJ blind*).ti,ab; 13835 results.</p> <p>33. EMBASE; assign*.ti,ab; 230529 results.</p> <p>34. EMBASE; allocat*.ti,ab; 80310 results.</p> <p>35. EMBASE; volunteer*.ti,ab; 171121 results.</p> <p>36. EMBASE; CROSSOVER PROCEDURE/; 38140 results.</p> <p>37. EMBASE; DOUBLE BLIND PROCEDURE/; 111987 results.</p> <p>38. EMBASE; RANDOMIZED CONTROLLED TRIAL/; 337339 results.</p> <p>39. EMBASE; SINGLE BLIND PROCEDURE/; 17932 results.</p> <p>40. EMBASE; 27 OR 28 OR 29 OR 30 OR 31 OR 32 OR 33 OR 34 OR 35 OR 36 OR 37 OR 38 OR 39; 1362223 results.</p> <p>41. EMBASE; 26 AND 40; 62 results.</p>		
Medline	<p>14. MEDLINE; "group analytic psychotherapy".ti,ab; 9 results.</p> <p>15. MEDLINE; ANALYTICAL PSYCHOTHERAPY/; 0 results.</p> <p>16. MEDLINE; GROUP THERAPY/; 11640 results.</p> <p>17. MEDLINE; 15 AND 16; 0 results.</p> <p>18. MEDLINE; (group adj3 "analytic psychotherapy").ti,ab; 10 results.</p> <p>19. MEDLINE; "group analysis".ti,ab; 2792 results.</p> <p>20. MEDLINE; GROUP PSYCHOTHERAPY/; 11640 results.</p> <p>21. MEDLINE; 14 OR 15 OR 16 OR 17 OR 18 OR 19 OR 20; 14382 results.</p> <p>22. MEDLINE; SOCIAL PHOBIA/; 9067 results.</p> <p>23. MEDLINE; SOCIAL ANXIETY/ OR SOCIAL ANXIETY DISORDER/; 0 results.</p> <p>24. MEDLINE; "social anxiety*".ti,ab; 3051 results.</p> <p>25. MEDLINE; 22 OR 23 OR 24; 10705 results.</p> <p>26. MEDLINE; 21 AND 25; 200 results.</p> <p>27. MEDLINE; "randomized controlled trial".pt; 367293 results.</p> <p>28. MEDLINE; "controlled clinical trial".pt; 87861 results.</p>	88 (less duplicates =84)	

	29. MEDLINE; randomized.ab; 287360 results. 30. MEDLINE; placebo.ab; 151625 results. 31. MEDLINE; "drug therapy".fs; 1675625 results. 32. MEDLINE; randomly.ab; 208520 results. 33. MEDLINE; trial.ab; 297658 results. 34. MEDLINE; groups.ab; 1330842 results. 35. MEDLINE; 27 OR 28 OR 29 OR 30 OR 31 OR 32 OR 33 OR 34; 3284540 results. 36. MEDLINE; 26 AND 35; 88 results.		
	Total results (less duplicates)	247	
<b>Summary</b>	<b>NA</b>	<b>NA</b>	

### Disclaimer

BEST in MH answers to clinical questions are for information purposes only. BEST in MH does not make recommendations. Individual health care providers are responsible for assessing the applicability of BEST in MH answers to their clinical practice. BEST in MH is not responsible or liable for, directly or indirectly, any form of damage resulting from the use/misuse of information contained in or implied by these documents. Links to other sites are provided for information purposes only. BEST in MH cannot accept responsibility for the content of linked sites.