

Best Evidence Summaries of Topics in Mental Healthcare

BEST in MH *clinical question-answering service*

Question

“In adults with borderline personality disorder, how effective is group analytical psychotherapy, compared to any other psychological intervention, in improving patient outcomes?”

Clarification of question using PICO structure

Patients: Adults with borderline personality disorder
Intervention: Group analytic psychotherapy
Comparator: Any other psychological intervention
Outcome: Any patient outcomes

Clinical and research implications

No high quality, relevant evidence was identified.

What does the evidence say?

Number of included studies/reviews (number of participants)

N/A

Main Findings

N/A

Authors Conclusions

N/A

Reliability of conclusions/Strength of evidence

N/A

What do guidelines say?

NICE guidelines for borderline personality disorder (2009, CG78) make the following comments about group analytical psychotherapy but make no recommendations regarding employing it as an intervention:

Group analytic psychotherapy

“This is also often known simply as ‘group therapy’. It is characterised by non-directive groups (without pre-determined agendas), in which the relationships between the members, and the members and the therapist (‘conductor’), comprise the main therapeutic tool. Such groups generally, and deliberately, build a strong *esprit de corps* and are both strongly supportive and deeply challenging. The membership of a group is fairly constant, with each member staying typically for 2 to 5 years. Suitably qualified group therapists (to United Kingdom Council for Psychotherapy [UKCP] standards) undergo at least 4 years’ training, have regular clinical supervision and undertake continuing professional development (CPD) activities.

The group process can help prevent hazardous therapeutic relationships developing with a therapist, as can happen in individual therapy with people with severe personality disorders. They can actively address relationship difficulties that are manifest ‘live’ in the group, and they can avoid difficult dependency by helping participants to take responsibility for themselves by first sharing responsibility for each other and later learning how to ask for help for themselves, in an adaptive way.

Disadvantages include difficulty in initiating participation because of the fear of personal exposure; problems of finding a regular suitable meeting space; and issues of confidentiality.” (pp. 31)

Date question received: 28/02/2014

Date searches conducted: 17/03/2014

Date answer completed: 04/04/2014

References

Guidelines

National Institute for Health and Care Excellence (2009) Borderline Personality Disorder: Treatment and Management. CG78. London: National Institute for Health and Care Excellence.

<http://www.nice.org.uk/nicemedia/live/12125/43045/43045.pdf>

Search Details

Source	Search Strategy	Number of hits	Relevant evidence identified
<i>SRs and Guidelines</i>			
NICE	borderline AND (analytic OR dynamic)	75	1
DARE	1 ((Psychotherap* OR Group adj1 therap* OR psychoanal* OR anal* adj1 psychotherap*)) IN DARE 829 Delete 2 MeSH DESCRIPTOR Psychoanalytic Therapy EXPLODE ALL TREES 20 Delete 3 MeSH DESCRIPTOR Psychotherapy, Group EXPLODE ALL TREES 192 Delete 4 MeSH DESCRIPTOR Psychotherapy EXPLODE ALL TREES 1798 Delete 5 #1 OR #2 OR #3 OR #4 2019 Delete 6 (((aggressiv* or anxious* or borderline* or dependent* or emotional* or passiv* or unstable) adj2 personalit*)) IN DARE 41 Delete 7 MeSH DESCRIPTOR Borderline Personality Disorder EXPLODE ALL TREES 27 Delete 8 #6 OR #7 54 Delete 9 #5 AND #8 32	32	0
<i>Primary studies</i>			
CENTRAL	#1 group analytic psychotherapy 160 #2 "group analysis" 1538 #3 MeSH descriptor: [Psychotherapy, Group] explode all trees 2249 #4 MeSH descriptor: [Psychoanalytic Therapy] explode all trees 150 #5 #1 or #2 or #3 or #4 4027 #6 MeSH descriptor: [Borderline Personality Disorder] explode all trees 224 #7 BPD 598 #8 "borderline personality disorder" 384 #9 #6 or #7 or #8 835 #10 #5 and #6 33 Central only 31	31	0

PsycINFO	<p>1. PsycINFO; "group analytic psychotherapy".ti,ab; 133 results.</p> <p>2. PsycINFO; ANALYTICAL PSYCHOTHERAPY/; 1396 results.</p> <p>3. PsycINFO; GROUP THERAPY/; 16764 results.</p> <p>4. PsycINFO; 2 AND 3; 183 results.</p> <p>5. PsycINFO; (group adj3 "analytic psychotherapy").ti,ab; 142 results.</p> <p>6. PsycINFO; "group analysis".ti,ab; 1957 results.</p> <p>7. PsycINFO; GROUP PSYCHOTHERAPY/; 16764 results.</p> <p>8. PsycINFO; 1 OR 2 OR 3 OR 4 OR 5 OR 6 OR 7; 19244 results.</p> <p>14. PsycINFO; CLINICAL TRIALS/; 7361 results.</p> <p>15. PsycINFO; random*.ti,ab; 127202 results.</p> <p>16. PsycINFO; groups.ti,ab; 361525 results.</p> <p>17. PsycINFO; (double adj3 blind).ti,ab; 17682 results.</p> <p>18. PsycINFO; (single adj3 blind).ti,ab; 1381 results.</p> <p>19. PsycINFO; EXPERIMENTAL DESIGN/; 8971 results.</p> <p>20. PsycINFO; controlled.ti,ab; 79198 results.</p> <p>21. PsycINFO; (clinical adj3 study).ti,ab; 7782 results.</p> <p>22. PsycINFO; trial.ti,ab; 67013 results.</p> <p>23. PsycINFO; "treatment outcome clinical trial".md; 26252 results.</p> <p>24. PsycINFO; 14 OR 15 OR 16 OR 17 OR 18 OR 19 OR 20 OR 21 OR 22 OR 23; 559094 results.</p> <p>26. PsycINFO; BORDERLINE PERSONALITY DISORDER/; 3936 results.</p> <p>27. PsycINFO; "borderline personality disorder".ti,ab; 5961 results.</p> <p>28. PsycINFO; BPD.ti,ab; 3621 results.</p> <p>29. PsycINFO; 26 OR 27 OR 28; 7408 results.</p> <p>30. PsycINFO; 8 AND 29; 132 results.</p> <p>31. PsycINFO; 24 AND 30; 58 results.</p>	58	0
Embase	<p>14. EMBASE; "group analytic psychotherapy".ti,ab; 51 results.</p> <p>15. EMBASE; ANALYTICAL PSYCHOTHERAPY/; 0 results.</p> <p>16. EMBASE; GROUP THERAPY/; 15694 results.</p> <p>17. EMBASE; 15 AND 16; 0 results.</p>	45 (less duplicates =36)	0

	<p>18. EMBASE; (group adj3 "analytic psychotherapy").ti,ab; 54 results.</p> <p>19. EMBASE; "group analysis".ti,ab; 3880 results.</p> <p>20. EMBASE; GROUP PSYCHOTHERAPY/; 15694 results.</p> <p>21. EMBASE; 14 OR 15 OR 16 OR 17 OR 18 OR 19 OR 20; 19338 results.</p> <p>22. EMBASE; BORDERLINE PERSONALITY DISORDER/; 8718 results.</p> <p>23. EMBASE; "borderline personality disorder".ti,ab; 4725 results.</p> <p>24. EMBASE; BPD.ti,ab; 7179 results.</p> <p>25. EMBASE; 22 OR 23 OR 24; 14157 results.</p> <p>26. EMBASE; 21 AND 25; 269 results.</p> <p>27. EMBASE; random*.ti,ab; 850207 results.</p> <p>28. EMBASE; factorial*.ti,ab; 22209 results.</p> <p>29. EMBASE; (crossover* OR cross-over*).ti,ab; 66921 results.</p> <p>30. EMBASE; placebo*.ti,ab; 192449 results.</p> <p>31. EMBASE; (doubl* ADJ blind*).ti,ab; 137472 results.</p> <p>32. EMBASE; (singl* ADJ blind*).ti,ab; 13835 results.</p> <p>33. EMBASE; assign*.ti,ab; 230529 results.</p> <p>34. EMBASE; allocat*.ti,ab; 80310 results.</p> <p>35. EMBASE; volunteer*.ti,ab; 171121 results.</p> <p>36. EMBASE; CROSSOVER PROCEDURE/; 38140 results.</p> <p>37. EMBASE; DOUBLE BLIND PROCEDURE/; 111987 results.</p> <p>38. EMBASE; RANDOMIZED CONTROLLED TRIAL/; 337339 results.</p> <p>39. EMBASE; SINGLE BLIND PROCEDURE/; 17932 results.</p> <p>40. EMBASE; 27 OR 28 OR 29 OR 30 OR 31 OR 32 OR 33 OR 34 OR 35 OR 36 OR 37 OR 38 OR 39; 1362223 results.</p> <p>41. EMBASE; 26 AND 40; 45 results.</p>		
Medline	<p>14. MEDLINE; "group analytic psychotherapy".ti,ab; 9 results.</p> <p>15. MEDLINE; ANALYTICAL PSYCHOTHERAPY/; 0 results.</p> <p>16. MEDLINE; GROUP THERAPY/; 11640 results.</p> <p>17. MEDLINE; 15 AND 16; 0 results.</p>	51	0

	<p>18. MEDLINE; (group adj3 "analytic psychotherapy").ti,ab; 10 results.</p> <p>19. MEDLINE; "group analysis".ti,ab; 2792 results.</p> <p>20. MEDLINE; GROUP PSYCHOTHERAPY/; 11640 results.</p> <p>21. MEDLINE; 14 OR 15 OR 16 OR 17 OR 18 OR 19 OR 20; 14382 results.</p> <p>22. MEDLINE; BORDERLINE PERSONALITY DISORDER/; 4869 results.</p> <p>23. MEDLINE; "borderline personality disorder".ti,ab; 3723 results.</p> <p>24. MEDLINE; BPD.ti,ab; 5454 results.</p> <p>25. MEDLINE; 22 OR 23 OR 24; 9451 results.</p> <p>26. MEDLINE; 21 AND 25; 154 results.</p> <p>27. MEDLINE; "randomized controlled trial".pt; 367293 results.</p> <p>28. MEDLINE; "controlled clinical trial".pt; 87861 results.</p> <p>29. MEDLINE; randomized.ab; 287360 results.</p> <p>30. MEDLINE; placebo.ab; 151625 results.</p> <p>31. MEDLINE; "drug therapy".fs; 1675625 results.</p> <p>32. MEDLINE; randomly.ab; 208520 results.</p> <p>33. MEDLINE; trial.ab; 297658 results.</p> <p>34. MEDLINE; groups.ab; 1330842 results.</p> <p>35. MEDLINE; 27 OR 28 OR 29 OR 30 OR 31 OR 32 OR 33 OR 34; 3284540 results.</p> <p>36. MEDLINE; 26 AND 35; 51 results.</p>		
	Total results (less duplicates)	145	
Summary	NA	NA	

Disclaimer

BEST in MH answers to clinical questions are for information purposes only. BEST in MH does not make recommendations. Individual health care providers are responsible for assessing the applicability of BEST in MH answers to their clinical practice. BEST in MH is not responsible or liable for, directly or indirectly, any form of damage resulting from the use/misuse of information contained in or implied by these documents. Links to other sites are provided for information purposes only. BEST in MH cannot accept responsibility for the content of linked sites.